



Edinburgh International Culture Summit

24 to 26 August 2016

Friday 26 August 2016 (Afternoon): Closing Plenary

CONTENTS

	Col.
RAPORTEURS' SUMMARIES	1
Catherine Holden (Cultural Consultant, Edinburgh)	1
Sir Paul Grice (Clerk/Chief Executive, Scottish Parliament)	4
Julia Amour (Director, Festivals Edinburgh).....	7
OPEN SESSION	11
Américo Castilla (Secretary of National Heritage, Argentina).....	11
Michelle Saidi (European Youth Forum)	12
Bilel Abboudi (Ministry of Culture, Tunisia).....	13
Francesca Reed (European Youth Forum).....	14
Daisuke Matsunaga (Consul General of Japan in Edinburgh).....	16
Thomas McEachan (Member of the Scottish Youth Parliament)	16
Rt Hon Matt Hancock (Minister of State for Digital and Culture, UK Government).....	18
Lauren Ross (Youth Arts Voice Scotland).....	18
Fiona Hyslop (Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs, Scottish Government)	20
CLOSING REMARKS	21
Sir Ciarán Devane (Chief Executive, British Council)	21
Fergus Linehan (Festival Director, Edinburgh International Festival)	22
A SPECIAL PERFORMANCE BY CAPE TOWN OPERA CHORUS	26
END OF SUMMIT 2016	27
Sir Jonathan Mills (Programme Director, Edinburgh International Culture Summit).....	27

Closing Plenary

Friday 26 August 2016 (Afternoon)

[The Presiding Officer opened the meeting at 14:06]

Rapporteurs' Summaries

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): Good afternoon and welcome to the closing plenary session of the 2016 Edinburgh International Culture Summit. I begin by inviting our three rapporteurs to report back on the three themes, starting with Catherine Holden on culture and heritage. Catherine has now successfully launched a career as a cultural consultant, following a prominent career in museums across Britain.

Over to you, Catherine.

14:06

Catherine Holden (Cultural Consultant, Edinburgh): Thank you very much.

Heritage is long and life is short. Three hundred and fifty million years ago, or thereabouts, the rocks deep beneath our feet here were molten lava, and 2 million years ago, a glacier crunched past us, carving out the landscape and exposing the rocky crags that overlook this building. By the iron age, human settlers had begun to make this their home, and around 700 years ago, builders started work on a palace on the hill, which became Edinburgh Castle. That is just the beginning of this place's story.

Our four sessions have reminded us in many different ways that we are the guardians of a great legacy and are just the latest in a long line of fellow women and men who have been exploring, making and remaking the world around them. A common theme in all our sessions was that cultural heritage is not just about buildings or things—although remarkable and diverse artefacts are absolutely vital to it—but that culture also means people.

From our four topics—urban regeneration, tourism, the protection of cultural heritage and best practice in the management of heritage—I have chosen some juicy reflections and suggestions for you to consider. First, we found that one of the keys to successful regeneration is—drum roll—a catalyst. That could be grabbing an opportunity such as funding or an international competition, or facing up to a problem such as acute poverty. Such so-called burning platforms are, in some cases, hideously literally so.

Other keys to successful regeneration are: leadership that is courageous and persistent; partnership—political, commercial and philanthropic; community ownership as a way both to derive ideas and to drive action; wisely balanced governance, with top-down structure and planning matched by bottom-up spontaneity and entrepreneurial dynamism; historical roots connected to routes forward to enable us to build on, but also, in some cases, to move past the past, exorcising false memories and superseding faded glories; and what we might call learning links—in other words, networks, such as the one that has been formed at this Summit, that enable us to have honest exchange. We reflected on the fact that others' experiences and success offer vital evidence for our own case for culture by helping us to influence sometimes suspicious communities or sceptical decision makers.

On tourism, we traced a clear shift from sun, sea and sand to self and self-discovery—from relaxation to revelation. As a result, cultural tourism is growing exponentially. One speaker noted that by 2050 half of our planet will be on the move visiting the other half.

There was some divergence in the room. Some delegates currently have no tourism economy to speak of, whereas others are groaning under the strain of massive demand.

We learned that the successful destination—drum roll number 2—will use technology ingeniously to manage the challenges of marketing, choice, time and space. It will look after its home team—the local citizens who constitute the culture, the welcome and the experience—who can too easily feel swamped or resentful when the tourists arrive, and it will understand that the visiting team is no more homogeneous than its own citizens and, in fact, brings diversity to a place. As a result, it will use the power of cultural experiences such as festivals to create a spirit of exchange beyond the one-way gaze of the clicking camera lens.

Speakers warned of overreliance on “top 10” tourism icons, which leads to overcrowded bottlenecks and narrows perceptions of a place. A successful destination will go beyond a tick-box listicle approach to tourism, and will create new stories with its people while honouring geographical and conceptual fringes. We are meeting in a city that knows how to love a fringe.

We ranged from tourism to trauma—from leisure to horror. Our session on cultural heritage in crisis explored the all-too-obvious and less-recognised implications of that for a place and its people. It is interesting that speakers expanded the focus from the awful physical destruction that is highly visual and so tends to grab our screens and front pages, to emphasise the arguably larger issues of illicit

trade supported by global underground criminal networks, and mass displacement of people whose loss tears the heart, the voices and the stories out of a place.

However, there are positives. We heard that cultural protection is not formally in the terms of reference for United Nations peacekeeping forces or the military—hence the scenes of museum looting in Baghdad back in 2003, when soldiers stood by looking on—but that is being addressed country by country with new terms, and supporting training to ensure that they are applied, being introduced.

Many nations, including the United Kingdom, have still not signed the 1954 Hague Convention, but at least one delegate in the room yesterday resolved to take that issue home and provide that vital signature.

A Japanese colleague reminded us that the remarkable treasures of the beautiful city of Kyoto were not destroyed in the world war that prompted the Hague Convention. That was a conscious decision that gives us hope amid the darkness.

Finally, I turn to our workshop on heritage sites, from post-gold-rush Australia to China and Edinburgh, that are taking practical steps to connect historic protection absolutely with contemporary development. The steps include—this is the final drum roll—engaging small and large businesses to take an interest in and then to invest in heritage; resisting the vested interests of the privileged, who may seek to monopolise the opportunities and the narrative of their heritage; and creating a positive cycle in which the profits of tourism are used to pay for the maintenance and renewal of the cultural assets on which that tourism relies. Numbers are vital in influencing the economic case, but they are not all. The heritage sites asked the people who live and breathe their places what they see as precious, and how to engage others in those stories.

Contributors acknowledged that it is hard to involve communities, with all their exciting and sometimes infuriating diversity. People are likely to disagree. Participants discussed how to engage and the right questions to ask.

Finally, the workshop proposed recasting the word “heritage”. Instead of its being a noun that decodes a set of fixed things and objects, the workshop proposed the word as a verb for a dynamic human process of exploration, interaction and reinterpretation of the past into the present and the future. So let us heritage ourselves.

One of our speakers invited us to close our eyes for a moment, think back 25 years, remember a place that we had known since 1991, and reflect on how much it has changed since then. I now invite you to close your eyes for a moment, if you

wish, and connect the past with the present and beyond, to think forward 25 years and imagine how your place, this place and the world around us might look if we truly committed to putting heritage at the heart of our future. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Catherine.

I now ask Sir Paul Grice to summarise the conversation on culture and economics. As you may know, Paul is the chief executive of the Scottish Parliament, so he is one of our key hosts, but he also agreed—in fact, he volunteered—to be one of the key participants.

14:15

Sir Paul Grice (Clerk/Chief Executive, Scottish Parliament): Thank you, Presiding Officer. This is a report back from the round tables that considered scenarios for cultural sustainability, which also takes on board some of the points from the workshop on entrepreneurial skills.

If I may, I will start by thanking the chairs, presenters and my fellow rapporteurs, as well as all those who contributed. One of the groups was dominated by a very passionate debate on a challenge to the assumption that there is a benign circle of government, economy and culture. In many countries, the contemporary reality is that the role of culture is to counterbalance divisive political forces, both within countries and between countries. That poses a challenge to the cultural sector, and raises in particular the question whether we are, by not doing enough to counterbalance, at risk of contributing to that divisiveness rather than tackling it.

There was discussion in other round tables about the interrelationship between culture and communities at all levels, from state to local. On one hand there is the role of government and its agencies in supporting culture, and on the other there is the critical role of culture—specifically the effect that rediscovering and exploring a heritage such as language can have in nation building and, indeed, in helping to rebuild communities. We had practical examples of that from Singapore and some of the reservations of the United States of America.

It was clear from all the round tables that different political and economic contexts exist around the world. That is an obvious point, but it is highly relevant as we look to take forward ideas from this Summit and translate them into action. Where government is able and willing to provide support, that is good. There are many examples of where and how that is done successfully that could be synthesised. For example, a key role that government can and does play is in providing infrastructure. However, an important question

then is whether we have the right infrastructure, and that is a very broad issue. In a physical sense, it could relate to space and facilities. However, the question is whether it is the right type of space in the right places. That certainly covers digital access. There is also a strand around the skills and creative talents of cultural entrepreneurs.

It is also clear, however, that government is not the only player; indeed, in some contexts it is not a major player, in terms of providing direct support. Many examples emerged from the round tables of where the private sector, alone or in partnership and at different scales, can enable cultural activity to thrive—for example, the film industry in Nigeria, Sri Lanka, India and the United States of America. An asset-based placed and market-making model is a practical suggestion of a new way of doing things. Complex related issues including crowdfunding and new investment instruments were discussed. Again, I say to Jonathan Mills that I think that there is a piece of work that could be done to bring together in an accessible format practical examples both to inspire and to guide.

Inclusiveness came out as a theme. Questions were asked about who benefits from investment—in particular, public investment. In terms of consumption—if that is a term that we are allowed to use—people's propensity or ability physically to attend performances can sometimes be very exclusive. What is more likely nowadays, however, at a time when culture is increasingly disseminated through digital platforms, is the risk of digital exclusion.

It was also noted that the arts can sometimes be competitive and siloed, and that reconciling that with community ownership is a practical challenge. Inclusion was acknowledged as a genuinely difficult issue. In my view, such candour is an important starting point for looking at how the issue can be tackled.

To return to digital technologies, many examples were given of where more sophisticated use and analysis of data—for example, from social media—could enable more effective management and sustainability of cultural resources, whether natural or built. Alongside that, there is a need to generate more appropriate metrics. I, for one, learned a great deal about how the Scottish Parliament could look to measure its success in that regard.

An issue that was common to all the round tables was measurement of value and impact, which Catherine Holden touched on. There was a strong argument made that, because the economic value of the cultural sector is so easily demonstrated, we need to move beyond that. We can cite, for example, that the cine industry in Nigeria will have a value of \$8 billion by 2019, and that the cultural sector in Mexico generates over 7

per cent of gross domestic product from 3.5 per cent of the workforce. To use an example from much closer to home, the Edinburgh festivals were, back in 2011, estimated to have generated over £0.25 billion of additional expenditure in the Scottish economy.

I, personally, think that we would be unwise to neglect entirely the ability to converse in those narrow but well-accepted economic terms, but there was a strong sense that we need to find new ways to tell the story of value. That links back to things such as nation and community building and rebuilding. Have we sufficiently explored wellbeing and happiness and some of the related indices? In any event, we must not fall into the trap of thinking about the issue only in terms of numbers. We need a narrative to persuade and influence decision makers and a narrative to persuade and engage the public.

A key question at the heart of that is this: what does cultural benefit look and feel like? If we can nail that, we will be getting somewhere. Again, there is some practical thinking from the Summit that can help with that. As with many of the points that were raised in the workshops, the issue comes down to leadership. This morning's debate touched on an issue around the training, encouragement and support that we give to leaders in the cultural sector to address that.

A simple—but to my mind, critical—point was made that, in all our consideration of cultural sustainability, we must not forget the importance of the artistic act itself. Investment must support that act and policy must be built around it, because it is that creative endeavour that produces the substance on which everything else is founded.

On a related point, one of my favourite phrases of the Summit is “strategic modesty”, which I think means that those who support culture and the arts, particularly public sector agencies, should not be ambitious for their own performance but should, within a vision, be responsive to the performance of the artists whom they aim to support.

In conclusion, Presiding Officer, I have to say that strategic modesty is perhaps something that we might reflect on as we return to our day job in a couple of weeks here in the Scottish Parliament.

Thank you very much indeed. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: I made a note of that very phrase. Thank you, Sir Paul.

Our final rapporteur, who will speak on culture and participation, is Julia Amour. Julia is the director of Festivals Edinburgh, so I am delighted that she has been able to join us during this month, of all months.

14:23

Julia Amour (Director, Festivals Edinburgh):

Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen. I applaud the very well-crafted speeches of my colleagues and I beg your indulgence for mine, which has been constructed over the last hour and a half over a slightly soggy sandwich.

What can we as policy makers learn about culture and participation from this morning's sessions? Across all the plenary meetings and other discussions, I have been struck by the rich picture that we have been collectively building about the need to understand the impacts that cultural participation can bring at four levels—the individual, social, civic and intercultural levels. Those are the four lenses that I offer for my remarks this afternoon.

In the individual and social spaces, we all heard wonderfully touching testimony this morning from David Leventhal and Matthew Peacock about the power of dance and music to restore a sense of pride, confidence and social connection. A key concept is that cultural participation enables people to focus on what matters to them and not what is the matter with them. That was expanded on in the two workshops on performance science, which brought forward the growing and very exciting body of evidence for the psychological, neurological and physical benefits of dancing and making music.

Aaron Williamon spoke about drumming work with older people in Japan and Switzerland and the multiple small-scale studies that now exist demonstrating the link between music and wellbeing. He spoke about the need for that research to scale up so that there is a good evidence base that we can translate into real-life policy making.

We learned about the accepted research behind the five-a-day prescription for wellbeing—connect, be active, be curious, give and keep learning—and how well that maps on to what art and culture can mean in all our lives.

Peter Lovatt, who I should say is a regular participant at our Edinburgh International Science Festival—there we know him as Dr Dance—said that rhythm is the very first thing that develops in babies, even before speech. It is therefore essential to wellbeing and we should recognise that and use it more throughout life.

Two settings where dance and music should be making a significant impact on policy making were highlighted. The first relates to how we learn from a young age, and therefore the need to reinvent the curriculum and the school day and think about how learners create and process memories that can be embodied in cultural activity that has meaning for them. One practical example is that

maths might be easier to learn after you have done some dancing.

The other setting relates to restorative and protective applications for conditions such as Parkinson's and depression. Where illness has made people feel disabled, they can feel re-enabled through dance and helped to choreograph their way through their disease.

We also talked about the need to constantly tie policy back to practice and complement our lived understanding of how dance can be used in different places and spaces with our scientific understanding of its contribution. Although science and arts are often seen as polarities, they are absolutely complementary, and we are on the threshold of understanding that relationship much better.

On the idea of the four levels of impact, the session on strategies for engaging diverse communities looked more at the social, civic and intercultural levels. Musical metaphors were also used to convey the way in which arts and culture can foster an understanding that all our identities and communities are multicultural by, as a participant made clear, breaking down the song lyrically, melodically and rhythmically.

The group also felt that culture needs to create connections between people and ideas, not melt differences. That was likened to being at a mixing desk and cross-fading to mix distinctive inputs together while maintaining what was individual and original about each. That means living on the borders, collaborating to activate ideas and having a mature understanding of how, as other speakers have said, we can create risk leadership and collaborative leadership. We need to make the borders porous across cultures and across sectors, which means shaking up our institutions in the cultural space, the corporate space and other sectors. People also wished us to remember that we need a nuanced understanding of the fact that change often comes from individuals, small organisations and coalitions, which bring the outsider perspective that Jay Wang mentioned this morning.

Common threads from the sessions with regard to future directions included questions of scalability and sustainability in connecting our growing understanding of those benefits to public policy. Moreover, we need to find some way of ensuring that these things—the things that matter—happen everywhere and always instead of their being patchy and pilot.

Also, with regard to the learning about cross-disciplinary and cross-sector models, breakthroughs in understanding and innovation often come from cross-fertilisation across sectors. Someone highlighted the example of a virtual

application that helps musicians make small steps in building their confidence from a virtual rehearsal room to a virtual concert hall. The same techniques have also been applied to surgery and lacemaking.

That digital example brings us to the conversation about digital platforms that I was involved in this morning and in which we characterised the story that we heard as one of optimism, anxiety and the quest for action. We heard from Suhair Khan of the Google Cultural Institute a wonderfully optimistic vision of how new technologies can develop new audiences, provide global access and create new, immersive and inspiring cultural experiences by bringing together bits of collections from around the world in ways that were previously impossible, archiving temporary experiences such as festivals and providing new ways for professionals to engage with and understand cultural objects.

Jay Wang helped us to diagnose the reasons for some of our cultural and digital anxieties around how we navigate relationships between the physical and virtual worlds and how in the digital space we process, create and retain cultural memories and cultural identities differently. That might explain why the craving for face-to-face experiences is increasing at the same time as we are becoming more and more immersed in the virtual world.

In many societies, we have gone—overnight, it seems—from being information poor to being information rich. In the attention economy that we are now experiencing, the nature of storytelling and visual culture is changing rapidly, and we need the skills of arts and culture to understand that.

We then turned to the quest for actions with which to respond constructively to this fast-changing reality, and we acknowledged that digital platforms would change our ways of learning and push us more and more towards identifying the truly human dimension—towards asking the questions that Google cannot answer. We talked about people's need to engage with values, not objects, and the artist's role in making online engagements meaningful, by giving them a human voice and a point of connection. We recognised that sometimes we cling to the illusion that sharing is participating, and that we need to understand how to move beyond that. We talked about the emerging power dynamics of the information economy: the need for data to be accessible for social, cultural, educational and civic purposes; the need for artists and creators to have voices and spaces online, so that culture does not become ever more commodified; and the need for culture to have a central role in redefining our moral responsibilities in the online world.

We have covered a huge amount of ground in the past few hours. If I may, I will conclude with a personal reflection on the spirit of our discussion over the whole of the Summit. Listening to everyone here, I am struck more than ever by the fact that culture is a human miracle. The example that strikes me is that through ancient technologies from different civilisations—the alphabet, paper, printing—we are able to experience a shared humanity with people who lived millennia ago; with, for example, the playwright Terence, from the second century BC. He was of North African origin, was born a slave, and lived only to age 25. He wrote:

“I am human, and nothing human is alien to me”.

In the past few days, those of us who have been lucky enough to sit in this room have seen that it is our responsibility to try to create our own modern cultural miracle that spreads the opportunity to connect and empathise as widely as possible across our communities, across our nations and across our world.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you very much, Julia. I thank Catherine Holden and Paul Grice, too.

Open Session

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): I ask people not to go anywhere. We will now go into an open session. It is our only open session, I am afraid, and it will be too brief—only 30 minutes. I have had nine representations, and there will be more people who wish to dip in, and we do not have a lot of time. There may be observations and there may be questions, and if any of our rapporteurs or possibly any of our partners wish to respond they should catch my eye, and I will take them in.

We have a limited amount of time, so if you want to make a point you should make it as briefly as you can. You should not come down to the lectern. If you stand up where you are, we will switch your microphone on so that you can make your contribution.

I call Américo Castilla, from the Argentinian culture ministry.

14:32

Américo Castilla (Secretary of National Heritage, Argentina): Thank you. I am Secretary of National Heritage, from the Ministry of Culture of Argentina. When I took the taxi to the airport to come here, the driver asked which company I was flying with. When I said “British Airways,” he asked whether I was going to England. When I said “No, I’m going to Scotland,” there was silence, so I felt the need to say, “That’s part of Great Britain.” He said, “I’m afraid that you’re wrong. It’s part of the United Kingdom.” I am expecting lesson 2 when I go back. That is to say that nowadays information is something that one can find on the internet. A phrase that was spoken here was “learning links”, and that is more important. That is what culture provides.

Our cultural institutions put together people from any circumstances—people who are from the public sector, from the private sector or individuals.

I read the newspaper this morning and saw that visas for foreign students will be reduced, mostly for those coming from outside the European Union. I was reminded that I came here as a student and did my postgraduate at the Slade school of art. I would not be here and have the knowledge that I have if that approach had been in place; I am a physical case and advocate for continuing to admit foreign students to Great Britain—or the United Kingdom.

As a student, an artist, the founder of a small foundation and as someone now in the public sector, I have taken risks—another important word

that has been heard over the past few days. As an artist, that is the only way of doing work.

The TyPA Foundation, which is in the private sector, last year held a very significant gathering of museum people—an event called “Reimagining the museum”—where we had 700 attendees from 24 countries. It was said to be one of the most radical conferences ever, on account of the social commitment from the people attending, and we will hold it again next year in Medellín in Columbia. We want Latin America to be represented with its new ideas, which reflect more the social ambience and the way that culture has been redefined to adapt to the social needs of the people than conversations among the elite.

We are preparing for an event in November called “Chaos at the museum: infiltrating the urban fabric”. We are organising that with Central Saint Martin’s and two US universities—Davis University in California and George Washington University’s Corcoran school for arts and design—which highlights the importance of alliances. I heard it said today that when you have passion, determination and good allies, you do not necessarily need money to start—I can prove that. Once you have those conditions, you are playing the game and the money starts to flow, which is important for small organisations. Now that I have a place in Government, I continue to agree with the idea of taking risks because one understands where one comes from and the constituents of the matters that we take into our responsibility.

We have already made a new museum policy that will bring radical changes to our 24 national public museums, as well as collaboration with institutions from all over the world, and we want to include the UK as a main partner.

Thank you very much for inviting me, for inspiring ideas and for permitting the dialogues with, for example, people such as those I met from China for the first time ever, as well as from other countries. I would not have been allowed to participate in those dialogues if I had not been invited to share these days with you. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you very much, Mr Castilla. I call Michelle Saidi from the European Youth Forum.

14:39

Michelle Saidi (European Youth Forum): Thank you, Presiding Officer. I am part of the youth delegation and I am from Manchester.

I will start by telling you a small story. There was a girl who moved from Africa to the UK. As you know, language barriers begin when you move from one country to another. I think that it was Matthew Peacock who said that you have to be a

foreigner to be able to understand culture. The girl moved to this country, where everything was new, and she took up the arts to be able to understand the language. My mum always told me that music has no language—to solve the puzzle, in case you have not figured it out, I add that the girl was me. I was nine years old when I moved to the UK. I joined the music group and I was in the drama club and the dance club—I am not a very good dancer, but I was in the club, and that is how I was able to make friends, because the movement told the story.

I think we all agree that culture is important—otherwise, we would not be here—but there is something that I want to point out. To me, it is the elephant in the room. We all know that culture is important, but it is always one of the first things that gets cut in times of hardship, along with the youth budget. Those tend to be the first things that go. Education and health are important, of course, but so is culture. I was inspired by Professor Abdulkarim's story about what he does. If it was not inspirational enough to remind us all how important culture is, I do not know what else would be.

During the policy round tables yesterday, I had a conversation with Emma Ruse about statistics. As a politics student, I have to know about statistics, which are one of the things that help us to understand, but to me, politics tells us only what is going on. What about talking to people who can tell us why things are the way they are, why they are happening and why they exist? Rupert Myer said that, when we ask someone about their story, we can only refer to them as one person. What is wrong with that? That one person can tell us more than information about 1,000 people on a piece of paper. It is about trying to engage with communities and asking people what it is that makes them who they are.

What is culture to other people? We know what it is because we are involved in it, but what about people in our communities? Do they know what culture is, or what it is that makes them who they are? What is wrong with being one person? Maybe that is the step forward to finding numbers two, three and four and painting a bigger picture than what we see on pieces of paper.

Thank you for having us. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Michelle.

I call Mr Bilel Abboudi, from Tunisia.

14:42

Bilel Abboudi (Ministry of Culture, Tunisia): Thank you, Presiding Officer. The delegation from Tunisia thanks the UK Government, the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament for

enabling our participation in the Summit, and we especially thank the British Council.

I was supposed to give a speech of thanks, but I want to mention that the theme of the Summit is relevant to our current phase of building a new Tunisia. Delegates will know what has happened in Tunisia since 2011. We are now in a phase of democratic transition, and the population—all the people—are in a phase of change and transformation and are reviewing our frameworks.

In history, a modern Tunisia had already been built by culture at the beginning of independence. It was built on education and culture by the leader Habib Bourguiba, and at that moment we had access to the arts and to education. We got our modern Tunisia. I hope that our culture, especially the arts and heritage, as well as nationhood—which is a term that I really like—will play a major role in getting Tunisia out of the phase of change and in getting a new framework for democracy.

Our participation ties in with the Summit's theme of building resilient communities. That participation helps us to see new opportunities to explore or, if not to explore—after all, culture cannot be explored—to review our priorities in our cultural policies. We can then connect culture to really important things in our transformation phase—by which I mean, connecting arts and development, heritage and development, democracy and culture and culture and change overall.

I thank you for enabling our participation in this Culture Summit. Thank you, Edinburgh, and thank you, everyone who has supported us. We are looking forward to future co-operation. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Abboudi. What I normally do in Parliament is to give speakers advance notice, so I will try to do that rather than ambush them. I will call Mr Matsunaga in one second but first I will call Francesca Reed from the European Youth Forum.

14:46

Francesca Reed (European Youth Forum): Let me begin by saying:

“We are the shapers of culture, the workers of change and the dreamers of dreams.”

From what we have heard in this summit, there is no denying that we all recognise how essential and valuable culture is in building a resilient society, so what I want to leave you with today are two tangible, practical ways in which culture can not only be sustained but thrive: accessibility and affordability—the two As.

From my experience working with young people from across the UK, it is clear that we need to make culture more accessible to them, and that we need to do that on two levels. First, on the

practical level, there is a postcode lottery in mental health provision in the UK; the same can be said for culture and the arts. Young people who live in large, urban areas such as London and Edinburgh are surrounded by cultural opportunities. Although that is a great thing, young people in rural, isolated areas are often forgotten. It is vital that we improve opportunities for young people in less populated areas. Again, it comes back to the idea that this is not all about numbers but about the depth of impact made on each person who benefits from the cultural experience.

However, there is also a second level to accessibility, and it relates to belief systems. We have a duty to inspire young people to believe that they can be involved—that, for example, opera is open to you whatever your background, that you are welcome in any museum and that cultural opportunities are for you. That comes down to education, and it is therefore absolutely vital that the arts and culture remain an integral part of the curriculum. Throughout my secondary school life, I suffered from severe anxiety, and music lessons and the performing arts were a release for me. Even when I felt as though I was the smallest human being on the planet, I felt when I went on stage that I was someone and that someone wanted to listen.

The second A is affordability. With cuts hitting every sector, particularly culture, we need to create new ways of sustaining that sector and enabling it to thrive. One way that we discussed—and something that we can do—is to utilise what is already out there. From a young person's perspective, so many passions and new ideas are coming through and young people are so eager to get their views heard, make a change and bring new ideas to culture. However, one thing that we really need to think about is how we can use those passions effectively, economically and in a creative way. Instead of just creating new cultural activities and new cultural ideas, we need to think more about how we can utilise and improve on what is already there, make connections and build a stronger force for bringing about better cultural opportunities.

Finally, if there is something that this summit has shown us as young people, it is that in order for culture to thrive, we must remove the barriers between young people and politicians and between young people and people who work in the arts. We as young people need to be at the forefront of cultural policy in our communities and our countries, and we need to be equal partners in policy round tables. After all, we are the ones who will be continuing to fly the culture flag in the future.

Thank you. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Francesca. On that note, I understand that the Youth Forum is going to hold its final session at 4 pm in Committee Room 1, and that everyone is welcome.

In a minute, I will call Thomas McEachan. First, I call the Consul General of Japan, Mr Daisuke Matsunaga.

14:50

Daisuke Matsunaga (Consul General of Japan in Edinburgh): Thank you, Mr Presiding Officer.

I would like to express my heartfelt thanks to the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament, who have made this wonderful exercise possible. If I could summarise the past three days in one word, that word would be “inspiring”.

I was particularly fascinated by the session on culture and participation. The great lesson that I learned is that art and culture are not only for the talented few but for everyone, including those people who have physical and mental difficulties. I also learned that we are born to enjoy art and culture—indeed, that we are born to dance. I recall that in my high school days I was generally considered to be a geek—a studying-only type who read books all the time and had no fun—but when everyone realised that I was also a good disco dancer, there was much hilarity. [*Laughter.*]

The past three days have given us an opportunity to make wonderful connections. Had it not been for this conference, I would not have been able to meet so many interesting people. I am truly grateful to the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament for that, and I am grateful to the Presiding Officer, who has handled the meeting very skilfully and often with a touch of humour. Thank you. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Matsunaga. I think that there was a ripple of warm recognition when you talked about being considered a geek rather than a dancer—from half the room, obviously.

In a second, I will call the Rt Hon Matt Hancock, who is one of our sponsors and co-hosts. First, I welcome Thomas McEachan from the Scottish Youth Parliament.

14:53

Thomas McEachan (Member of the Scottish Youth Parliament): Presiding Officer and delegates, I sit in this Parliament as a testament to the deep and meaningful impact that culture can have on the lives of people all around the world. I am someone who has been profoundly moved and

inspired by the work of our contemporary artists and the words, sketches, paintings and music of our predecessors.

I have directly benefited from the truth that those artists captured. As a child, I was bullied and harassed. Other pupils did not approve of my sexuality, or did not quite understand what it meant to be gay. I felt ostracised and alone. I felt that there was nowhere I could go, no one I could look to, and nothing—absolutely nothing—that I could do.

Of course, my school, my family and my friends did what they could to help. They offered reassurance and they offered education to the others, to help them to understand that I was not different but just like them. That worked for them, but the training and the dialogue that it opened up never really helped me to accept myself. Deep inside, I was confused, angry and frustrated with myself for being born this way. There was a point when I would look in the mirror with disgust.

But there was hope for me yet. I found identity in the words of Philip Pullman, Shakespeare and J K Rowling, to name but a few, who showed me—a scared little boy—that I should love myself, love others and do my best to make the world better. If it was not for their words, I doubt that I would be sitting here today, and I certainly would not be representing my local area, Glasgow Pollok, in the Scottish Youth Parliament.

What is the point of this story? It is quite simple, really. Culture, whatever form it takes, wherever it is experienced and whatever the language of the creator, changes lives. Culture changes lives, whether we are talking about the woman with Parkinson's who found that she could dance, the girl who found comfort when she accessed art therapy to help her mental health or the homeless people who performed an opera to a crowd of their peers. Culture changed my life, and it can change so many more lives in future.

Delegates, as we leave the Summit today, I want you to remember that I said that. I want you to remember my story and those of all the others. I want you to lock that up in your mind and bring it to the forefront of your memory. We can become bogged down in numbers, which we have all agreed are quite important, but I want you to remember the human element in all this and to be mindful of that when you make decisions.

Do what you can, preserve what you can, build the infrastructure that you can and engage with those who are disengaged and feel left behind. Thank you for an amazing Summit and thank you for listening. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. In a moment, I will call Lauren Ross, but first I call Mr Matt Hancock MP.

14:55

Rt Hon Matt Hancock (Minister of State for Digital and Culture, UK Government): On behalf of the UK Government, I say to everybody that it has been a huge pleasure to co-host the conference, which has been a success. The slogan of the Edinburgh International Festival is "Welcome, World" and we have certainly welcomed the world in the past few days. We have delegations from 40 diverse countries and 23 ministers who have travelled internationally to be here. I think that we can all agree that the contribution from the 40 youth participants, to whom we are all grateful, has been successful and inspiring.

The Summit has taken place at the same time as the Edinburgh Festivals, which attract about 4 million visitors. This is a brilliant time of year to hold such a conference.

There have been striking moments for us all, such as the contributions of Matt Peacock and David Leventhal this morning. Professor Abdulkarim reminded us what really matters in the area that we all work hard at. That has redoubled my enthusiasm to ensure that we deliver on the cultural protection fund that the UK Government proposes and that we ratify the Hague convention; indeed, I can tell the Summit that, having signed the convention, the UK Government will ratify it over the next six months in the UK Parliament. [*Applause.*]

We need to build on such strength for next time. I have no doubt that, by then, the world will have changed—for the better, we hope, in many places, and certainly for the more digital in almost all places. Indeed, that has been a strong theme of the conference.

I hope that delegates have seen some of the best of Britain. We are open for business, open for investment, outward facing to the world and open for cultural exchanges that transcend all boundaries and which, as has been said, connect across communities and around our world in a way that only culture can. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. In a moment, I will call Fiona Hyslop, who will be our final speaker in this section, but first I call Lauren Ross from Youth Arts Voice Scotland.

14:58

Lauren Ross (Youth Arts Voice Scotland): Hello and thank you for allowing me to speak at the Summit. I think that I speak for everyone in the youth forum in saying that we have very much enjoyed listening to all the delegates and that we really value the opportunity to speak alongside you.

I am a member of Youth Arts Voice Scotland, which is one of the co-design projects that are led by Young Scot. For the two years that I have been involved, I have had the best work experience that I could have been given. Throughout my life, my parents and my school have supported my interest in the arts and culture, but the opportunities that I have gotten by being a representative of Youth Arts Voice Scotland have improved my confidence. I was always very shy, and I would never have expected to be speaking here at the age of 20 or at any time in my life. The organisation has supported me in my personal growth and I am very proud to be part of the great youth forum that is here today.

I am also a member of Heritage Blueprint, which is another co-design project. We are a panel of young people who work with the National Trust for Scotland to engage more young people in heritage. Although we are very much interested in heritage, a large proportion of the young population of Scotland are not very engaged, and we have been trying to come up with recommendations on how to engage them.

From my perspective, heritage, whether national or international, is simply a collection of stories, and a good story is of interest to everyone. A good story lies at the heart of the most successful films and books that everyone loves and it is the very foundation of all our identities. So if heritage is simply stories, why are so many young people or people in general disengaged? That means that the communication is not effective. We need the support of good storytellers, and who are the storytellers? They are the artists. Art and heritage are two spokes on the wheel of culture. They have a lot in common and, in working together, they can support each other. With art's support for heritage, more young people and people of any age who are interested in heritage would become more interested, and I believe that, with that stronger fusion, the interests of art and heritage would improve.

I hear through the grapevine that France has started a new scheme to give young people free access to cultural institutions. However, as we have realised through our work, money is not everything. It will definitely help more young people become engaged, but we have to drive forward the idea that heritage is something that everyone should be interested in because, basically, it is our story. I recently read a collection of essays on art by John Berger, the famous essayist, in which he described the present as a past that we can influence. Describing the past in that way would engage people because, as we have been discussing at the Summit, it is about everyday life and who we are. It is not just about castles and hills. We do not necessarily need to define heritage, the arts or culture but we need to

communicate the breadth that all those topics have. We really have to focus on that, especially if we are to engage more young people.

Thank you for listening. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you very much, Lauren.

Our closing speaker in this section is our own culture minister here in Scotland, Fiona Hyslop MSP.

15:02

Fiona Hyslop (Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs, Scottish Government): Thank you very much, Presiding Officer, and thank you for so ably chairing this Culture Summit. Can we have more debates like this in the chamber every week, please?

The theme for the Summit is "Culture: Building Resilient Communities". Some of you will have been at the Tattoo last night and you may have heard the tune "Scotland the Brave". That will give you one sense of Scottish spirit, but I also hope that, from the last three days, you have a sense of the Scottish spirit of sharing, thinking and internationalism.

It is often said that culture tells truth to power, but I think that what we have heard over the last three days is that the importance should lie in culture and heritage giving power to the powerless or allowing the powerless to take power for their truth to be told. As we have heard, people's heritage can be sold, stolen or destroyed, so they should have the capacity to renew and rebuild.

One word that I have written down is "risk", which our Argentinian colleague mentioned. One issue is where power lies in the digital age or the new age in curatorial and political terms. We want our ministers and curators to be brave so that their decisions can help to create the conditions for success.

I particularly thank Jonathan Mills and the Summit Foundation, who have I hope helped us to become a resilient community of thinkers and actors. Also, the Youth Forum, of which I am tremendously proud, has helped to ensure that our community will be resilient in future. So let us value our culture and be proud, but if we are really going to help people in the world who need our support and inspiration, we all have to be brave. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you very much, cabinet secretary.

Closing Remarks

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): We will move to our closing remarks. Sir Ciarán Devane is the chief executive of the British Council, which is one of the founding partners of the Culture Summit.

15:05

Sir Ciarán Devane (Chief Executive, British Council): Thank you very much. I, too, shall attempt to be brief and succinct.

The partners are acutely conscious of the time that senior and important people from around the world have invested in the Summit, so the partners' commitment is that we will do our best to ensure that the impact of the Summit continues. For me, there are at least four levels of that impact.

First, we have all given or heard particular contributions that have been incredibly inspiring over the past days. I, too, pick out Professor Abdulkarim. If we want to know what bravery is, what he has done in Damascus and Syria is tremendous.

The second level of the impact is to do with some of the challenges that have been placed before us. Francesco Bandarin talked about our ability or inability to articulate to the development community why culture is such an important part of development. I know that I speak for some of our academic colleagues who are with us in saying that we will take that challenge forward and ask how we can produce the evidence and link into not only the financial business cases for projects, but the case for building that cultural and social capital.

The third level of the impact is in the bilateral relationships and conversations that have taken place. In my case, there is the memorandum of understanding with our friends from Nigeria and the honourable minister. I know that many other conversations have taken place.

Over the past few minutes, we have alluded to the final level of the impact, which relates to our role as not only leaders of culture in our own nations but globally, particularly in some parts of the world at the moment. I remind you that the world has not, of course, always been peaceful and happy. Let us think back to 1940, when we got our royal charter.

My UK colleagues are very tired of me talking about some of the founding principles of the British Council, which were articulated in our very first annual report, in 1940. It talks about the annihilation of distance bringing civilisations into dispute and neighbourliness having expanded

over time, from the person in the county next door having been a foreigner to our neighbours being in the Americas and on the China seas. Sitting down and writing that in 1940 as the bombs were falling was an act of cultural bravery. The report said that, once people were through that, they needed to promote the interchange of knowledge, ideas and discoveries to create a basis of friendly knowledge and understanding between peoples.

If we want to make the world a better, more prosperous and safer place, what we as the cultural community can do for cultural relations, cultural diplomacy and the exchange of ideas is incredibly valuable.

I will say a few thank yous, if I may. I thank our partners: the cabinet secretary for culture, Fiona Hyslop, who has been tremendously supportive; Matt Hancock from the UK Government and his peers and colleagues, who have been very supportive; the Edinburgh International Festival; Fergus Linehan; and, of course, Sir Jonathan Mills, without whom we would not be here at all. Jonathan is the inspiration behind the Summit. I cannot spot Sir Angus Grossart at the moment, but we would not be here without him either. He has made a tremendous contribution with the Edinburgh International Culture Summit Foundation and sorted the financial model behind what we have done.

I hope that we have demonstrated that the city of Edinburgh, Scotland and the United Kingdom are intent on being outward-looking, international and globally engaged communities, and I hope that you have had a fabulous time. We promise to write up the findings and ensure that we drive the impact forward and continue the conversations.

I thank each and every one of you for every word that has been said and every idea that has been shared. I wish you safe travels home and look forward to working with you all in the future.

Finally, I thank the Parliament, which has provided amazing facilities. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you very much, Ciarán. I ask Fergus Linehan to step up to continue the vote of thanks. As you know, Fergus is the director of the Edinburgh International Festival. He took up that appointment in 2014 to popular and critical acclaim.

15:10

Fergus Linehan (Festival Director, Edinburgh International Festival): Thank you, Presiding Officer.

Excellencies and ladies and gentlemen, on behalf of Joanna Baker and me from the Edinburgh International Festival and of all our sister festivals, I thank you for your contribution to

the Summit and your participation in our 2016 festival season. As Matt Hancock just said, we launched our season this year with the expression “Welcome World” blazoned across many of the city’s major buildings. Those bright yellow banners served to make up for some of the lack of sunshine throughout the month but, more pertinently, they became a sort of slogan for the distillation of what we are trying to achieve here in August and, indeed, what has been achieved here over the past few days.

What seems particularly appropriate about this Summit is that it takes place in the midst of so much artistic expression. That has given us a connection with those whose work is enlivening and enriching our communities and has given the whole discussion around cultural policy a really practical edge.

I come here before you today as a curator, producer and cultural entrepreneur. Throughout this city this month there are men and women of extraordinary drive and energy who have committed time, energy, creativity and money and have stepped into what is the most competitive cultural environment in the world because they passionately believe that they have something to say that the world needs to hear.

Artists and cultural managers are some of the most hard-working business people who I have ever encountered. They take extraordinary risks and overcome extraordinary adversity. It is very fitting that the work of the partners is supported by the Summit Foundation, which is a group of leading business people, entrepreneurs and companies led, as Ciarán said, by Sir Angus Grossart, because the mind and spirit of the entrepreneur and the mind and spirit of the artist have much in common. As we move towards the closing of the Summit, I would like to thank and pay tribute to the dancers, actors, musicians, visual artist, writers, choreographers and designers. We remain first and foremost at your service, so thank you so much.

When this festival finishes on Monday, we start the next festival the following day. There have been extraordinary conversations here, but there are three very practical things that I am going to take away that will affect my work on Tuesday morning. They are to do with leadership, with evaluation and data, and with risk.

What is very clear at the moment is that there are extraordinary opportunities but also extraordinary complexity. I congratulate Jonathan Mills on the addition of the Youth Forum, because it has brought home—certainly, to me—that the level of complexity that young people are going to have in their future is far more dense than that which I have encountered. There is an enormous responsibility on us in terms of mentoring and the

development of future leadership. That has really come home to me throughout this Summit and is something that I think that we will need to work on very carefully, particularly with regard to our view on the year of young people in Scotland in 2018. There are great opportunities that we need to start thinking about and working on.

The second thing is to do with data and evaluation. I note the comments of Professor Mike Power on how we measure and quantify success. The recent studies in relation to the impact of Edinburgh’s festivals were very valuable in a twofold sense because they illustrated the particular benefits that accrue to Scotland and the UK, and because they used the same measures that we had used five years earlier. That meant that it was more than just simply a case of advocating but actually a measure of where we are going, where we are succeeding and where we have work to do. It occurred to me that all of us need to work together on shared methodologies and data collection so that we can not only advocate but begin to measure the changes that are undoubtedly happening in our cultural geographies.

The third thing is about risk. Again, Mike Power talked about risk in a very open way and he mentioned the discomfort that we sometimes feel in talking about the nature of risk. I therefore thought that I would tell you a quick story about the origins of the festival, which you might not have heard.

The Edinburgh Festival almost did not happen. Despite the commitment of the British Council and the City of Edinburgh Council, the funding for the festival was not fully in place in the run-up to it. That was the case until the Earl of Rosebery, who lived outside Edinburgh in Dalmeny House, stepped forward. In an extraordinary stroke of luck, his horse had won the derby, and he donated the winnings to the festival. To make something like this happen involved the commitment of local government, national Government and the community, but it also required a horse to come home.

Of course, the real reason for the longevity of this festival—we are heading towards our 70th anniversary next year, when we hope to see all of you—concerns something that is at the heart of what the past few days have been about. In 1949, the Scottish Nobel laureate, Sir John Boyd Orr, proposed that our festival be considered for the Nobel prize. In his citation, he wrote something that still feels as relevant today as it did then:

“Aught that we can do to bring together men and women from all parts of the world; aught that we can do to assist them to find a common interest and mutual understanding in the revelation of the music and art of the great masters; aught that we can do to establish an incorruptible love of truth, to create a lofty spirit of freedom and to blend a moral

and intellectual guiding force in the future of the world—ought that we can do in this respect will meet the greatest need of mankind and confer the greatest gift upon a wavering civilisation.”

Thank you very much. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Fergus.

A Special Performance by Cape Town Opera Chorus

15:16

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): We began the day with some dance, and we will move towards a conclusion with some music.

I am delighted to have the opportunity to introduce to you a fantastic act: the Cape Town Opera Chorus, which won the 2013 International Opera Awards chorus of the year award and has gone from success to success, from the townships of Johannesburg to the Berlin Philharmonic, under Sir Simon Rattle. In the past two years, the chorus has sung in the Netherlands, Portugal, Perth, Munich and Barcelona, and it has a programme this year of more than 100 performances in Cape Town, France, Germany, Italy, the United Kingdom and Argentina.

The Cape Town Opera Chorus performed two songs: Elijah Rocks and Bawo Thixo.

The Presiding Officer: What a fantastic note to end on. I noticed the delegates from Lesotho joining in—I believe that there are two spaces in the choir available. [*Laughter.*]

End of Summit 2016

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): To close the Summit, I ask the programme director, Sir Jonathan Mills, to address us all. [*Applause.*]

15:27

Sir Jonathan Mills (Programme Director, Edinburgh International Culture Summit): Ladies and gentlemen, I am overwhelmed by what I have heard, enriched by what you have shared and inspired by the journeys that you have made.

There are some practical things for us to do if we are to capture some of the energy, opportunities and challenges that we have all articulated. We will be in touch. We will write up the findings and will bring you into a kind of communion of conversations not as a memento of what we have done but as an opportunity to continue the discussions that we have had here and put many of them into practice.

As I said in my opening remarks, you come to a place that prides itself on its practicality and its empirical tradition of observation over hunch. One of the challenges that we face is to take all the intuitions about our world that we know to be true and translate those into actions for real change.

I look forward to your company in 2018. Thank you for coming to the third Edinburgh International Culture Summit. I also thank the British Council and the Edinburgh International Festival, which provided such a wonderful closing note. You can hear the chorus that you just heard in a production of “*Così Fan Tutte*”—I would not be the past festival director if I did not promote that show. It is on tomorrow afternoon and there are still tickets to be bought.

I thank the Scottish Government and Fiona Hyslop, who has been our minister for the duration of the three Summits. She has made a very important contribution to this. [*Applause.*] I also thank both Andrew Dunlop and Matt Hancock of the UK Government for their support.

The British Council is an extraordinary resource for this country, but it is a resource for many of your countries as well and I am delighted that we have been able to make much more of that extraordinary resource. It keeps British enterprises honest about the reality of the world and opens the world up to Britain. I say a heartfelt thank you to Ciarán Devane, Rod Pryde and their teams all over the world—quite literally—for the incredible support and connections that they have made on behalf of the Summit. [*Applause.*]

Finally, I thank those who put the Summit together. There is an incredibly talented team here at the Parliament under Roy Devon. I refer also to

Ewan Mackenzie and the team at the Scottish Government, as well as Ben Spencer, Lisa Barrett and the team at the Edinburgh International Culture Summit Foundation, who all contributed hugely to the Summit’s success.

There will be a few family secrets to be shared with us afterwards, as you would expect, but I hope that you have enjoyed their care and consideration while you have been in Edinburgh. Of course that is the case because, over nearly 70 years, this city has learned an enormous amount about opening its mind and heart to the world. I hope that that is what you take away with you—the generosity of spirit has been the particular legacy of the festival and the city over nearly 70 years.

Thank you for coming to be with us. I hope that you will come back. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Jonathan.

Enjoy the rest of Edinburgh. I wish you all a safe journey home and I now close the Summit.

Summit closed at 15:32.

